

Translation ideology analysis in the English and Indonesian subtitles of Hige wo Soru. Soshite Joshikousei wo Hirou. on Muse Youtube channels

Theodore Mario Billyarta, Harwintha Y. Anjarningsih*

Department of Linguistics, Universitas Indonesia, Depok 16424, Indonesia

* **Corresponding author:** Harwintha Y. Anjarningsih, harwintha@ui.ac.id

ARTICLE INFO

Received: 11 September 2023

Accepted: 18 October 2023

Available online: 25 January 2024

doi: 10.59400/fls.v6i1.1970

Copyright © 2024 Author(s).

Forum for Linguistic Studies is published by Academic Publishing Pte. Ltd. This article is licensed under the Creative Commons Attribution License (CC BY 4.0).
<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/>

ABSTRACT: Today, Muse YouTube channels are deemed to be the most prominent platforms for watching anime for people in many Asian countries, including Indonesia. Making use of the concept of Extralinguistic Culture-bound Reference (ECR) and seven translation strategies proposed by Pedersen, this quantitative research sought to identify the dominant translation ideologies of the English and Indonesian subtitles of the anime series Hige wo Soru. Soshite Joshikousei wo Hirou. on Muse Asia and Muse Indonesia and analyze the choices of translation strategies found in the subtitles of both languages. The Indonesian and English subtitles of thirteen episodes of Hige wo Soru. Soshite Joshikousei wo Hirou. were analyzed by two judges with expertise in Japanese, English and Indonesian. The judges agreed on 91% of the data and discussed the rest to reach an agreement. The results indicated that five among seven translation strategies offered by Pedersen were found in the subtitles, and both the Indonesian and English subtitles share the same dominant ideology: foreignization. In spite of the same dominant ideology, the two languages exhibited fundamental differences when it comes to rendering the ECRs. In addition, the research also drew an interpretive conclusion that also serves as a practical implication that the audiences' familiarity with Japanese culture, time and space's availability, and the guideline based on other factors outside of the field of translation were three reasonable components that had a part in the subtitling team's choices of strategies.

KEYWORDS: extralinguistic culture-bound reference; dominant ideology; translation comparison; translation strategies

1. Introduction

Japanese pop culture takes many shapes, with the most preeminent ones being TV dramas, popular music, manga, and anime. Among them, anime is perhaps the one that resonates down powerfully with many Indonesians. While Japanese culture considers anime as an umbrella term for all animated works, regardless of the origin, the rest of the world considers it an exclusive term designated for animated movies and series produced in Japan (Oxford Advanced Learner Dictionary). For around three decades (the 1980s to the 2000s), television broadcasting was presumably the major means of diffusing anime in Indonesia. Some years after entering the new millennium, the advancement of the internet brought about a new way to enjoy anime: online streaming. Streaming services such as Crunchyroll started to gain ground among international and Indonesian anime fans. Despite the perks offered, some parties did not

acquiesce to the paid nature of these newborn online streaming services. Consequently, they opted for illegal streaming websites which provide access to a library full of free, pirated anime.

The year 2020 saw significant changes in how the Indonesian audience watches anime as a localized YouTube channel that uploads anime series, Muse Indonesia, made an entrance in the local market. Muse Indonesia is part of Muse Communication Co., Ltd., a Taiwan-based entertainment company distributor specializing in acquiring the rights to distribute anime shows. In 2019, one year prior to the launching of Muse Indonesia, Muse Communication Singapore as the subsidiary of Muse Communication Co., Ltd. founded Muse Asia YouTube channel which also uploads anime legally with English and Chinese subtitles for many Asian countries. While Muse Indonesia's anime repertoire per se is not exhaustive, the channel's existence is still cherished by the Indonesian public because for the first time, an easy-to-access, legal platform that provides Indonesian-subtitled anime for free is available. Furthermore, the carefree, interesting communication style demonstrated by its admins when interacting with their audiences also makes the channel even more alluring. Thanks to these factors, Muse Indonesia has garnered around 6.41 million subscribers as of this writing (29 March 2022). With 4.88 million subscribers, Muse Asia is also understood by the same token to be enjoying the (more or less) same popularity.

Every anime uploaded on Muse Indonesia is subtitled in Indonesian in the form of open captions. These subtitles, prepared by Muse Indonesia's subtitling team, spark linguistic debates from time to time. Some parties question the incorporation of many local elements into these Japanese shows, which ends up colliding with the 'Japanese-ness' of the concerned anime. On the other hand, a considerable part of the community believes that the inclusion of Indonesian elements in the show can help viewers, especially the newer ones, acculturate quickly to anime without having to deal with overflowing foreign concepts. This debate, which is not found among those who watch anime on the Muse Asia channel, fundamentally questions the translation ideology of the subtitles. Taking into account the popularity of the channels and the possible academic findings, this debate is a thought-provoking and worth exploring one.

Even though the practice of translation dates back to ancient times (Venuti, 2000), audiovisual translation (AVT) is considered a relatively new domain in translation. Translation theories had largely paid scant attention to AVT (Mujagic, 2013), and it was the increasing roles of entertainment media (particularly films and TV series) in everyday life that encouraged the needful recognition of AVT in the realms of translation (González, 2007). Moreover, the appearance of online streaming services acted as another catalyst behind the soaring demand for translated media (Orrega-Carmona, 2014). Translating cultures through subtitles is unfortunately not easy to achieve as it offers distinctive challenges. For example, the translators have to deliberate on how detailed cultural items should be translated as Cintas (2005) said that metalinguistic devices such as footnotes, prologues, or afterwords to give an explanation are not always a proper solution because of space and time limitations.

While there are a multitude of directories on the translation strategies of subtitles, this paper uses Extralinguistic Culture-bound Reference which was suggested by Pedersen (2005). Pedersen's ECR has been used and foregrounded in a number of studies. The study by Judickaitė (2009) endeavored to identify the English cultural-specific items in the Lithuanian subtitles of the movie *Ratatouille* (2007). Another study poring over ECR was conducted by Ruuttula (2018), in which the author explores the types of extralinguistic cultural references included in the Finnish films *The Happiest Day in the Life of Olli Mäki* (2016) and *Lapland Odyssey* (2010) and how these references have been translated in the English subtitles of the films. Finally, Sanders (2018) established research on a semiotic analysis and translation of one of Japan's all-time highest-grossing movies, *Spirited Away* (2001).

Likewise, translation comparison has appealed to many researchers, and it has been practiced across different fields. Granas et al. (2014) compared translated Norwegian, Swedish, and Danish translations of the Beliefs about Medicines Questionnaire and came up with the conclusion that discrepancies ranging from smaller inaccuracies to toward meaning-changing differences can occur even in the translations of closely related languages. In light of these problems, Granas et al. suggested research groups with similar linguistic backgrounds cooperate to create questionnaires that maintain their original meaning, validity and reliability. There have also been studies that compare translations whose material source is in Japanese. Jeffrey and Mitsuhiro (2007) compared the Chinese and English translations of Japan's then Prime Minister Junichiro Koizumi's official apology in April 2005. Skowronek (2017) compared the English, Dutch, German, and Swedish translations of Norwegian Wood, a Japanese novel by Haruki Murakami. In a similar vein, both studies deduce that translations in different languages, despite having the same material source, can differ from one to another in a number of ways. A more recent study by Rabouri et al. (2022) analyzed English translations of Iranian films movies screened at international film festivals with the results that the strategies of "substitution" and "direct translation" were found to be the most and least commonly used, respectively.

Based on these studies, it is understood that ECR is a versatile tool that can be used to perform an analysis on any variety of films from any culture. Nevertheless, these studies focused primarily on evaluating the translation strategies. They did not do further research on finding the dominant ideology of the subtitle, nor did they attempt to provide plausible and in-depth explanations behind the dominant ideology. Furthermore, the studies that compare subtitles of two different languages have been sparse. While it is not necessarily imperative, the above-mentioned research has shown the values of translation comparison, thereby calling attention to the production of similar studies. Consequently, this paper is intended to fill these gaps by presenting an analysis that includes the comparison of the established dominant ideologies of its corpus and comprehensive explanations that explicate their similarities and differences.

The work on this paper was centered on finding and analyzing the dominant ideologies of the Indonesian and the English subtitles of *Hige wo Soru. Soshite Joshikousei wo Hirou.*, one of the most watched anime in both Muse channels. This paper answered these following questions: (1) What are the translation strategies found in the English and Indonesian subtitles of *Hige wo Soru. Soshite Joshikousei wo Hirou.* on Muse Asia and Muse Indonesia? (2) What are the dominant ideologies of the English-subtitled and the Indonesian-subtitled versions of *Hige wo Soru. Soshite Joshikousei wo Hirou.* on Muse Asia and Muse Indonesia, respectively? (3) What are some possible explanations for the ideology choices?

Hige wo Soru. Soshite Joshikousei wo Hirou. (hereafter referred to as *Higehiro*) is a 13-episode anime series from Project No.9 studio. The anime adapted a Japanese romantic comedy light novel series of the same name by Shimesaba and boota. The series aired from 5 April 2021 to 28 June 2021. It tells the story of Yoshida, a salaryman who allows Sayu Ogiwara, a runaway high schooler, to stay in his apartment. *Higehiro* was chosen to be the corpus of this research because it fits three criteria set by the researcher: (1) The series must be completed, (2) The series must display noticeable impacts on the society, (3) The series must take place in present-day Japan. First, the completion of the series is indispensable to avoid hasty conclusions. The completion also allows the researcher to observe the consistency of the translation ideologies. Second, the impacts of the series are important to make the research useful and meaningful to the readers, including those with minimal knowledge of anime. In the case of *Higehiro*, its impacts reached not only the local (from Japan's perspective) society, but also international audiences. For example, a TikTok post from Kementerian Kesehatan RI uses Sayu Ogiwara, one of the two main

characters of the series, to encourage Indonesians above 18 to get vaccinated for COVID-19. This vaccine awareness campaign post went viral and with 3.9 million views (29 March 2022), it became Kemenkes RI's TikTok post with the highest engagement. In Japan, Higehiro also became a cause célèbre among the society. The male main character's decision to help a minor girl by letting her live with him is thought to be morally gray since such an action is considered a minor kidnap attempt according to Japanese laws. Finally, Higehiro was chosen because it takes place in present-day Japan. These time and place settings are important because they affect the availability of Extralinguistic Culture-bound references as the backbone of this analysis. Anime with fantasy settings set in a different period will not be able to provide sufficient ECRs to be compared with items from our present-day, real life.

2. Method

To find out and perform an analysis on the dominant ideologies of the Indonesian and English subtitles, this quantitative research was conducted in three steps, with the first two steps being particularly centered around Pedersen's Extralinguistic Culture-bound Reference (ECR) concept. The first step and the second step are pertinent to Pedersen's Subtitling Norms for Television (2011) and How is Culture Rendered in Subtitles? (2005) respectively. The concept of ECR was chosen to be the fulcrum of this research because it caters to the field of subtitle translation. Moreover, ECR is more precise and well-defined than similar terms in the cluster such as realia, culture-specific item, culture-bound problem, or cultural sign (Ruuttula, 2018). This is proven by one crucial point, which is the exclusion of idioms, proverbs, slang, and dialects. They were ruled out because they belong to the study of intralinguistic culture-bound references. As for the third step, the chosen ECRs were mostly analyzed using the help of reputable Japanese-Japanese dictionaries such as *Kōjien* and *Daijirin*.

The first step was to watch all episodes of the anime and compile the ECRs. The Indonesian and English subtitles of thirteen episodes of Higehiro were analyzed by two judges with expertise in Japanese, English and Indonesian (the author and a graduate of the Japanese Study Program at the FIB UI experienced in AVT translation). Of the 1316 tokens, there were 96 types. Interrater agreement was 91% and 9% were discussed by the judges until they came to an agreement about the status of ECR. The items were collected from both audio and visual sources. However, items found in the opening and ending songs were not included since the songs are not always subtitled. For the specific categorization of the items, Pedersen (2011) produced a list of ECR domain categorization that consists of 12 different domains: (1) weights and measures, (2) proper names, (3) professional titles, (4) food and beverages, (5) literature, (6) government, (7) entertainment, (8) education, (9) sports, (10) currency, (11) technical material, and (12) other. Nonetheless, Pedersen made clear that although during the construction of the domain some semantic overlaps are inevitable, these overlaps do not necessarily undermine the explanatory power of the categories. In addition, Pedersen himself also indicated that his categorization is not definite, and the construction of the domain categorization rests upon the particular aspects one wants to emphasize. Hence, a domain categorization suited to the needs of this research was created and presented in **Table 1**.

The second step was to use Pedersen's concept of transculturality to understand the familiarity (or lack thereof) of the two target languages with the chosen items. According to Pedersen, transculturality refers to how many ECRs are now accessible on a global scale because of globalization. This implies that the ECRs that once were familiar only to people in one culture, are now not very culture-bound. There are three types of ECRs in terms of transculturality: Transcultural ECR, Monocultural ECR, and Microcultural ECR. A Transcultural ECR is an ECR which is generally known in both source and target languages or belongs to a third culture. A Monocultural ECR is an ECR that is less or unidentifiable to the majority of the native speakers

of the target language. Finally, A Microcultural ECR is an ECR that is too local to be known even by the majority of relevant source language audience. For instance, a certain slang used by people living on a certain street in a certain city can be classified as a Microcultural ECR. To find out whether an ECR is generally known in a language, the researcher consulted two dictionaries: Kamus Besar Bahasa Indonesia and Oxford Advanced Learner Dictionary. The two dictionaries were chosen because they update their entries regularly, and they are known as reputable, accurate dictionaries in their languages.

The third step was to learn how the collected items were translated across different languages and conclude the dominant ideologies. the seven strategies to render ECR from Pedersen (2005) were utilized and featured in **Table 2**. Among the seven strategies, the numbers of these strategies on both foreignization and domestication side are equal. While most of these strategies could be broken down into more specific strategies, this research chose to take the main strategies for the sake of efficiency and suitability. For example, ‘Paraphrase’, a common strategy in translation derived from Substitution, was still treated as Substitution. At the end, the dominant ideologies were determined from the number of appearances of each strategy.

Finally, the fourth step scrutinized why the items were translated in their specific ways and discussed how the choices of strategies contributed to the dominant ideologies.

Table 1. The domain categorization for this research.

No	Domain
1	Personal names
2	Honorifics
3	Food and beverages
4	Social
5	Lifestyle
6	Gesture
7	Place
8	Building
9	Others

Table 2. The strategies to render ECRs.

No	Strategy	Orientation
1	Official Equivalent	Neutral
2	Retention	Foreignization
3	Specification	Foreignization
4	Direct translation	Neutral
5	Generalization	Domestication
6	Substitution	Domestication
7	Omission	Neutral

3. Results

A total of 1316 ECRs were gathered from the 13 episodes of Higehiro. **Table 3** demonstrates how these 1316 ECRs were distinguished in terms of transculturality. **Table 4** shows how these 1316 ECRs were rendered in each language of the subtitles, and **Table 5** shows and visualizes the percentage of each ideology. In addition, **Table 6** presents the domain distribution of the 1316 ECRs.

The numbers of transcultural and monocultural ECRs in both languages are roughly the same. Each language has more transcultural items, mostly because of the high frequency personal names. Interestingly, some loan words from Japanese, such as karaoke, yukata, and miso, were already included in the dictionary of both languages. There were five out of seven strategies to render ECRs proposed by Pedersen found in Higeiro: Retention, Specification, Generalization, Substitution, and Omission. In accord with the non-technical theme of Higeiro, it is not surprising that Official Equivalent, which places great emphasis on a bureaucratic and serious process, was not found. As for Direct Translation, which is often used to render the names of companies, official institutions, technical gadgetry, etc., was not found either because the aforementioned items were rendered using other strategies. Retention was the most frequently used strategy for both languages, followed by Substitution, Omission, Generalization and Specification. While the frequency of Specification, Generalization, and Omission does not differ greatly from one language to another, the contrast of Retention and Substitution's frequency between the two languages is easy to recognize. This will be explained in later sections.

The Indonesian and English subtitles share the same dominant ideology: foreignization. However, the gap between Foreignization and Domestication is much smaller for the Indonesian subtitle compared to its English counterpart. This will also be explored later.

The domain with the highest frequency is 'Personal Names', constituting 52.6% of total ECRs archived from the anime. The great number of items in this domain can be explained by the tacit Japanese norm that does not approve of addressing people without mentioning their names. Such an action is thought to be impolite. Honorifics, which are often added after a personal name, are the second most frequent domain with 32.4%. Gesture, or the compilation of stock phrases required by the Japanese etiquette, makes up 5.2% for the total ECRs. The rest of the domains have a percentage below 5%.

Table 3. Transculturality.

Indonesian		English	
Transcultural ECR	729	Transcultural ECR	733
Monocultural ECR	587	Monocultural ECR	583

Table 4. Strategies distribution.

Indonesian		English	
Official Equivalent	0	Official Equivalent	0
Retention	622	Retention	853
Specification	3	Specification	2
Direct Translation	0	Direct Translation	0
Generalization	12	Generalization	11
Substitution	519	Substitution	304
Omission	160	Omission	146
Total	1316	Total	1316

Table 5. Dominant ideologies.

Indonesian		English	
Neutral	160	Neutral	146
Foreignization	625	Foreignization	855
Domestication	531	Domestication	315

Table 6. Domain distribution.

Domain		
Personal Names	692	52.6%
Honorifics	427	32.4%
Food and beverages	29	2.2%
Social	32	2.4%
Lifestyle	28	2.1%
Gesture	69	5.2%
Place	22	1.7%
Building	15	1.1%
Others	2	0.2%
Total	1316	100%

4. Discussion

4.1. Personal names

Retention is the most frequently used strategy to render personal names, for both the Indonesian and English subtitles. In other words, the Japanese names are often left as they are. There are no attempts to add local nuance to the characters' names by modifying them. Another keypoint to note is the fact that the subtitled Japanese full names of both Indonesian and English versions preserve the traditional Japanese order (personal name after family name). For instance, the main character's name, 荻原沙優 (Ogiwara Sayu), is retained as Ogiwara Sayu in both languages. This runs counter to the usual 'norm' for Japanese names for foreign consumption, which has Japanese names written backward with family name after personal name. While the reason for not reversing the order has not been confirmed, it is possible that the subtitling teams of Muse have attempted to adhere to the latest official policy (2019) for Japanese names issued by the government of the previous prime minister, Shinzo Abe, through which it advocates retaining the traditional Japanese order for Japanese names when written in Latin script.

As explained before, in Japanese culture, addressing a person without mentioning their name can be considered demeaning. Leaving out the name of a person equates with thinking that the person's name is not important enough to remember, thus belittling them. This attitude is reflected in the dialogues of Higehiro. When possible, the characters always try to mention the names of the person that they are addressing, hence the astronomical number of names mentioned. From the point of view of translation, this intricate detail could be considered a challenge as repeating people's names many times is repetitive and unnatural in most languages. In response to that, alternative strategies like Omission and Substitution are also employed when who is being mentioned is clear from the context.

Besides avoiding redundancy, another factor that accounts for the usage of substitution or omission is the availability of physical space for subtitling. Translators must condense his translation in the space of the frame (Nornes, 1999), and in this regard, omitting personal names or replacing them with something shorter is one way to economize on subtitling some space.

4.2. Honorifics

The most evident difference between the Indonesian and English subtitles is the ways they render honorifics. On the whole, the main strategy of the English subtitle is Retention, whereas the Indonesia subtitle decides to unconventionally use Substitution to put similar Indonesian equivalents in place of the

authentic Japanese ones. Japanese honorifics such as ‘-san’, ‘-senpai’, and ‘-chan’ are retained in the English subtitle. However, they are all substituted with relatively similar Indonesian honorifics. Honorifics is the second most recurring domain in Higehiro, comprising 32.4% of total collected ECRs. With this frequency, it is possible that the domesticated honorifics, which are found and scattered on every episode, contribute significantly to creating the popular impression that the Indonesian subtitle is oriented towards domestication. Actually, other series subtitled by Muse Indonesia also have their honorifics substituted with local equivalents. In this respect, Substitution was most likely chosen to follow a predetermined guideline.

Relying on Substitution, however, left the Indonesian subtitling team with a precarious situation when it came to rendering the ‘-kun’ honorifics. According to the definition given by the Kōjien dictionary, -kun has some meticulous prerequisites such as only used to address peers or people lower than the speaker in the workplace hierarchy and mostly used for boys. Although these prerequisites are not always absolute in practice, they are still chiefly respected. Since there are no local honorifics that share the same characteristics, the Indonesian subtitles had no option but to use omission every time -kun appears. The English subtitle, which uses Retention, did not find this situation difficult.

In certain cases, even simpler honorifics like -san can be tricky to render. For instance, in the case of お揚げさん (oage-san), where -san is attached to the name of a food product. Since this usage is irregular and informal, both languages resorted to Omission. Higehiro also contains a number of esoteric honorifics, such as -senmu in Example H. According to the Daijirin dictionary, -senmu is an abbreviation of senmutorishimariyaku (専務取締役), one of company directors whose responsibilities consist of assisting the company president and managing general affairs. Inasmuch as there are details that cannot be concisely conveyed, both languages chose Generalization and used a more common term, manager.

4.3. Food and beverages

When it comes to rendering the names of food and beverages, both languages are rather inconsistent. For instance, Namachuu refers to draft beer (beer from a cask or keg, rather than from a bottle or a can) in medium size. Daijirin also explains that this type of beer is raw and unpasteurized. Since these details can be overwhelming for audiences who are not familiar with beers in general or Japanese drinks, both languages settled upon Generalization. Yakiniku was retained in the Indonesian subtitle but substituted with ‘barbecue’ in the English subtitle. It is unclear why yakiniku was substituted in the English version. Even when translating the same item, the chosen strategies could be inconsistent. For example, both languages used Retention to render bento in Episode 1, but they shifted to Substitution six episodes later.

4.4. Social

Social is another tricky domain to deal with because Higehiro has a considerable number of items with deeply rooted cultural nuances. For example, the senpai-kouhai relationship might resemble the general senior-junior relationship known in other nations at first glance. Moreover, Bright (2005) also said that the senpai-kouhai relationship corresponds with contemporary mentoring in Western organizations). Nevertheless, it has a distinctive attribute that sets it apart from the rest of similar terms. The senpai-kouhai relationship has its roots in Confucian values, and this is proven by the existence of comparable relationships in countries with a lot of influence from Confucianism such as China and Korea (Lee and Tamai, 2003), (Ma et al., 2019). In this case, both languages used Substitution to replace them with similar cultural equivalents.

The next item, yobisute, is closely linked to honorifics because it means ‘to address someone without

attaching an honorific'. In the English subtitle that always sticks to the Japanese honorifics, Substitution was used to paraphrase the sentence. Instead of blatantly adding the remove-the-honorific part in the subtitle, the subtitling team rephrased it smoothly by shifting the focus to calling by name only. This yobisute concept is somewhat more difficult to be applied for the Indonesian subtitle because calling someone, especially older people, without their honorific can be extremely impolite. As a result, they paraphrased it by using 'panggil pakai nama depan' as an alternative to the removal of honorifics, which strayed from the honorific-removing essence of yobisute.

The last item is keigo, a specific language system used for respectful and humble scenes that has its own set of vocabulary and grammatical forms. Since the concept of a distinguished language system for respectful and humble situations is not known in Indonesian and English, they both used Substitution to paraphrase the line.

4.5. Lifestyle

The domain of Lifestyle also has some tricky parts in it. Some of these items are borrowed from foreign languages like English, but the meanings are different from their English counterparts. There are also other items with very specific cultural meanings. Daijirin defines salaryman as somebody who lives on and works for a monthly salary. In everyday life, the word salarymen evokes the image of overworked white-collar Japanese workers. By choosing Generalization, the Indonesian subtitle chose to put salaryman in the basket as other office workers, dismissing its unique nuances. In the English subtitle, the term was retained.

According to Kōjien, Hyakumensou is a form of art involving simple clothing and changing facial expressions and performed in yose (a type of spoken vaudeville theatre in Japan). It also has a second meaning inspired from the first one, which is to show different facial expressions. For context, this word was used when Hashimoto was telling Yoshida that Yoshida's face 'did' hyakumensou when Gotou-san texted him. It is possible that the subtitling teams of both languages found that both dictionary definitions of hyakumensou were not the most natural ways to depict what happened to Yoshida. In that sense, they used Substitution to rephrase the sentence, and consequently, neither of the two Japanese meanings was covered.

Both Kōjien and Daijirin state that gyaru has the same meaning as the English word 'gal' (slang for girl). Nonetheless, Japanese popular culture interprets gyaru as a Japanese fashion subculture. Gyaruru girls are characterized by their tanned skin, dyed hair and colorful makeup, and these features can be used to describe the physical appearance of Asami, the one saying the line. Since foreign audiences might not be familiar with the gyaru subculture, both languages made use of Substitution to render it. The Indonesian subtitle replaced gyaru with cewek gaul (trendy girl), and the English subtitle used a vaguer 'this' in place of gyaru.

From the literal meaning alone, natsumatsuri can be considered as a Japanese summer festival. However, matsuri in Japan is different from festivals in other countries of the world. Matsuri originated from the celebration held by Shintō temples. While secular matsuri also exist, the one mentioned in Higehiro is sponsored by a (fictional) Shintō temple called Shinchu Hikawa. Daijirin explains that natsumatsuri is a matsuri organized for the purpose of fending off pestilence, harmful insects, storm, and flood damage. Both the Indonesian and English subtitles replaced natsumatsuri with their closest local equivalents.

Finally, the last example from this domain presents the word goorudo, a gairaigo (loan word) from

English's gold. In this context, gold refers to one of the background colors of a Japanese driving license. There are three colors: green, blue, and gold. Among them, gold is the one designated for good drivers with no negative track record on the road. Goorudo was said by Issa to assure Yoshida of his driving ability. For Japanese people, it is clear what is meant by gold here. However, the same cannot be said for foreign audiences, hence the use of Specification by both languages.

4.6. Gestures

Many of the gestures displayed in *Higehiro* revolve around the manners for when having a meal. Actually, they only consist of two repeated gestures: *itadakimasu* and *gochisou-sama deshita*. In Indonesian, *itadakimasu* is often translated as *selamat makan*. This is just, however, a cultural substitution because *itadakimasu* and *selamat makan* convey two different things. *Itadakimasu* is a conjugated form from *itadaku*, which means to receive (something) humbly. *Itadaku* is used a lot in everyday life, not just in meal-related situations. When someone says *itadakimasu*, the person affirms that they receive the meal with humility. This is different from *selamat makan*, which is telling that the person is going to eat shortly. English does not really have set phrases for this situation, so the subtitling team went for various alternatives such as thank you for the meal and the phrase loaned from French, *bon appétit*. There is also the polar opposite of *itadakimasu*, *gochisou-sama deshita*, which literally means 'it was a feast'. This phrase is used to express one's appreciation for the meal, and it is said only after finishing the meal. Both the Indonesian and English subtitles rendered *gochisou-sama deshita* using Substitution, replacing it with natural expressions in each language for the situation

Another Japanese gesture that appears frequently throughout the series is *otsukare-sama*. *Otsukare-sama* is a set phrase used to appreciate the hard work of the person that the speaker is addressing. In reality, *otsukare-sama* can also be used to start a conversation, uttered as a greeting, or to end a conversation. Using Substitution to render *otsukare-sama* and replacing it with 'terima kasih atas kerja kerasnya' or 'thanks for your hard work' are the most common strategies, even though they can sound unnatural sometimes. When there is a more appropriate choice, it could be paraphrased into something different, as shown in the Indonesian subtitle for Example Z. Saying 'selamat malam' (good night) as the very last thing to say before parting is more natural than saying 'terima kasih untuk kerja kerasnya'.

Tamaya is a phrase that Japanese people shout during fireworks displays. There is also another phrase to shout for this scene, *Kagiya*. According to Honda (2008), *Tamaya* and *Kagiya* are the names of major firework houses during the Edo period. Shouting their names is a way to appreciate the fireworks that they made. The background of this phrase is not really known outside Japan, and to understand why the people in the anime scene were shouting 'Tamaya!', the audience must understand the history. Unfortunately, additional notes could not be possibly added to explicate the history because of space and time limitations (Cintas, 2005). Given this dilemma, the Indonesian and English subtitling teams resorted to different solutions. The Indonesian subtitle retained 'Tamaya!', despite the possibility that people may not understand what it is. As for the English subtitle, 'Tamaya!' is replaced with 'Fireworks!', which could be understood as it is, but erases the historical significance.

4.7. Places

Similar to personal names. Retention is almost always used to render the names of places. The places mentioned in *Higehiro* are mostly real places. Besides Tokyo the capital city of Japan, the two biggest cities in Hokkaido, Sapporo and Asahikawa, also made their appearance. In case of Haneda, it is an international airport besides Narita that serves the Greater Tokyo Area. The Indonesian subtitle used Specification to let the audience know that Haneda is the name of an airport since this might not be clear.

4.8. Building

Various types of building, from karaoke to nekafe, could be found in the dialogues of Higehiro. In Japanese, the word karaoke can also be used to refer to the building where the action of karaoke takes place. In Indonesian and English, the word karaoke does not have this versatility. As a result, both languages use specification to make it clear that the object being discussed is the building. For nekafe, although it seems that there are no differences between nekafe and warnet or internet café on the surface, nekafe has another significance to Japanese people. People can go to nekafe not only to surf the internet, but also to stay temporarily (and in extreme cases, permanently). Moreover, nekafe's design also puts more emphasis on the respect for privacy, with the building being firmly partitioned. Therefore, warnet and internet café are more of cultural substitutes in this regard.

Konbini is another interesting ECR. Daijirin defines konbini as a small superstore that operates non-stop and specializes in supplying daily necessities. Unlike similar stores in other countries, not only does a konbini sell goods, but it also offers services such as Wi-Fi, bill payments, ticket reservations, ATMs, and printing services. The subtitles of both languages are not consistent with the translations for konbini. In Episode 4, the Indonesian and English subtitles translated konbini into *swalayan kecil* and convenience store respectively. In Episode 7, they reduced them into *swalayan* and store.

4.9. Others

Others are a domain for two items that do not suit the other categories. For instance, the Japanese currency yen was included here because currency does not befit the other domains. Yen is retained in Indonesian and English. Another item that belongs to this domain is a *dajare* (Japanese pun with bland connotation). To provide some context, Sayu is telling Yoshida that the konbini where she is working stockpiles a lot of katsudon lunch boxes during the exam season every year since katsu is supposed to help the students 'katsu' (win, ace, pass) the exam. This line presented difficulties for translation because the joke relies on the audiences' knowledge of Japanese. Without knowing the katsu homophone, it is impossible to understand the joke. Facing such difficulties, the Indonesian and English subtitles used the same strategy, Substitution, but with differences in execution. To mimic the pun, the English subtitle made efforts to incorporate *guts* and *done*, two words that sound like katsudon if combined. The Indonesian subtitle, however, decided to translate the line as it is. The strategy chosen for the Indonesian subtitle is called situational paraphrase, a sub-strategy offered by Pedersen that seems to be frequently used when rendering ECRs in puns.

5. Conclusion

The findings of this research can be condensed into three main parts of conclusion. First, there were five out of seven strategies to render ECRs proposed by Pedersen found in Higehiro. They are Retention, Specification, Generalization, Substitution, and Omission. Official Equivalent and Direct Translation were not found. Second, the dominant ideology, for both the Indonesian and English subtitles, is Foreignization. This is a contrastive finding to the mainstream opinion of the Indonesian audience who believed Domestication had a heftier part in the subtitles. Even so, the gap between Foreignization and Domestication of the English subtitle is considerably wide compared to that of the Indonesian subtitle. This is because the two languages used different strategies to render honorifics, which are a large, recurrent part of the ECRs.

In the introduction, we presented the background that every anime available on Muse Indonesia comes with Indonesian subtitles in the form of open captions. These subtitles, created by the subtitling

team at Muse Indonesia, sometimes ignite discussions about language. Some people raise concerns about the inclusion of many local elements in these Japanese shows, as it can clash with the original “Japaneseness” of the anime. Conversely, a significant portion of the audience believes that adding Indonesian elements to the shows can help viewers, especially newcomers, adapt to anime more easily without being overwhelmed by foreign concepts. This ongoing debate, which doesn’t exist among those who watch anime on the Muse Asia channel, essentially challenges the translation philosophy behind the subtitles. Given the popularity of these channels and the potential for academic insights, this debate is both intriguing and worthy of exploration. Our results are significant in that they show the dominant ideology is Foreignization presenting support for the opinion of some of the audience of this anime. Furthermore, the results also extended the findings of Granas et al. (2014), Jeffrey and Mitsuhiro (2007) and Skowronek (2017) by presenting an analysis that includes the comparison of the established dominant ideologies of Higeiro and comprehensive explanations that explicate their similarities and differences.

Lastly, there are three fundamental considerations that may apply for translators in choosing a translation strategy for subtitles shown in Higeiro: the audiences’ levels of cultural knowledge, the availability of time and space, and the parameters followed by the concerned channels. Cultural knowledge influences the subtitling teams to choose strategies that could compensate for the audiences’ lack of familiarity when it comes to uncommon objects and concepts. At the same time, they also need to create clear and concise subtitles that are quick to read. Finally, it is very likely that the subtitling teams also have the parameters for presenting themselves and their works. For instance, the ‘playfulness’ and the casual style can be found not only in the subtitles in anime on Muse Indonesia, but also in how the channel interacts with its subscribers. In other words, it is also possible that the choices of translation strategies were also influenced by other details outside the issues of translation such as marketing and social engagement.

The conclusion of this study is in line with the findings of Granas et al. (2014), Jeffrey and Mitsuhiro (2007), Skowronek (2017), and Rabouri et al. (2022) as it also concluded that there will always be differences even when translating the same items. Through this study, these differences and the contrastive dominant ideologies were dissected and punctiliously analyzed, thus filling the gaps left by previous studies that stopped on quick, surface level analysis.

In this study, however, the findings regarding the dominant ideologies focus on quantitative aspects, i.e., deriving from how often the strategies appear. To complement this study, it is also recommended that future studies explore the qualitative elements of the subtitling strategies. For instance, future researchers can carry out more research on the strength of each strategy to find out whether one strategy is more impactful than the others. In addition, a more extensive study that encompasses more series and platforms can be done too in order to capture the bigger picture.

Author contributions

Conceptualizing the research ideas, and validating the research findings to ensure accuracy and reliability, TMB and HYA; designing the research methods and procedures, implementating software used in the research, conducting analyses of the research data, conducting the research and gathering data, obtaining the necessary resources for the research, organizing the collected data, drafting the initial version of the manuscript, and creating the visual elements in the research, TMB; reviewing and editing the manuscript, providing oversight and guidance throughout the research process, managing administrative aspects of the project, and securing the funding for the research, HYA. All authors have read and agreed to the published version of the manuscript.

Conflict of interest

The authors declare no conflict of interest.

References

- Cintas JD (2005). Back to the Future in Subtitling. EU-High-Level Scientific Conference Series.
- González LP (2007). Fansubbing anime: Insights into the 'butterfly effect' of assengeron on audiovisual translation. *Perspectives*, 14(4), 260-277.
- Granås AG, Nørgaard LS, Sporrang SK (2014). Lost in translation? Comparing three Scandinavian translations of the Beliefs about Medicines Questionnaire. *Patient Education and Counseling*, 96(2). doi: 10.1016/j.pec.2014.05.010
- Izuru S (2008a). Kun. In: *Kōjien*, 6th ed. Iwanami Shoten.
- Izuru S (2008b). Gyarū. In: *Kōjien*, 6th ed. Iwanami Shoten.
- Izuru S (2008c). Hyakumensou. In: *Kōjien*, 6th ed. Iwanami Shoten.
- Jeffrey M, Mitsuhiko T (2007). Comparing the translations of Japan's Prime Minister Koizumi's official apology in April 2005. *Comparatio*, 11, 5-24, doi: 10.15017/16060
- Judickaitė L (2009). The notions of foreignization and domestication applied to film translation: Analysis of subtitles in cartoon *ratatouille*. *Jaunųjų mokslininkų darbai*, 2(23), 36-43.
- Lee K, Tamai K (2002). Confucianism as Cultural Constraint: A Comparison of Confucian Values of Japanese and Korean University Students. *International Education Journal*, 3(5), 33-49.
- Ma L, Qie N, Rau PP, Wang L (2019). Is the Senpai-Kouhai relationship common across China, Korea, and Japan? *Social Behavior and Personality*, 47(1), 1-12. doi: 10.2224/sbp.7404
- Matsumura A (1995a). Gyarū. In: *Daijirin*, 2nd ed. Sanseido Books.
- Matsumura A (1995b). Konbini. In: *Daijirin*, 2nd ed. Sanseido Books.
- Matsumura A (1995c). Nama biiru. In: *Daijirin*, 2nd ed. Sanseido Books.
- Matsumura A (1995d). Natsumatsuri. In: *Daijirin*, 2nd ed. Sanseido Books.
- Matsumura A (1995e). Sarariiman. In: *Daijirin*, 2nd ed. Sanseido Books.
- Matsumura A (1995f). Senmu. In: *Daijirin*, 2nd ed. Sanseido Books.
- Mujagic A (2013). Audiovisual Translation: subtitling the BBC's documentary "The Quantum Revolution" [Master's thesis]. *Lingue Moderne per la Comunicazione e la Cooperazione Internazionale*.
- Orrego-Carmona D (2014). Subtitling, Video Consumption and Viewers: The Impact of the Young Audience. *Translation Spaces*, 3(1), 51-70. doi: 10.1075/ts.3.03orr
- Oxford Advanced Learner Dictionary (n.d.). Anime. In: *Oxfordlearnersdictionaries.com dictionary*. Available online: <https://www.oxfordlearnersdictionaries.com/definition/english/anime?q=anime> (accessed on 12 January 2022).
- Pedersen J (2005). How is Culture Rendered in Subtitles? EU-High-Level Scientific Conference Series.
- Prime Minister of Japan and His Cabinet (2019). *Kōyō Buntō ni Okeru Nipponjin no Seimei no Ro-maji Hyōki ni Tsuite*. Available online: https://www.kantei.go.jp/jp/singi/seimei_romaji/pdf/moshiawase.pdf (accessed on 12 January 2022).
- Rabouri KR, Zare A, Fatehi Rad N (2022). English Subtitle and Extra-linguistic Culture-bound References (ECRs) at Fajr Film Festival. *International Journal of Language and Translation Research*, 2(4), 1-21.
- Ruuttula MM (2018). Translation of Extralinguistic Cultural References in the English subtitles of *The Happiest Day in the Life of Olli Mäki and Lapland Odyssey* [Master's thesis]. University of Eastern Finland.
- Skowronek L (2017). *Haruki Murakami in the West: Comparing the English, Dutch, German, and Swedish translations of Norwegian Wood*.
- Venuti L (2000). *The Translation Studies Reader*. Routledge.