ARTICLE

Analyzing Javanese Proverbs Translation in Relay Translation Context

Sujatmiko [1,2*] ⦿ , *Mangatur Rudolf Nababan* [3], *Djatmika* [3], *Supana* [3]

[1] *Linguistics Department, Sebelas Maret University, Surakarta 57126, Indonesia*

[2] *English Department, PGRI University of Yogyakarta, Yogyakarta 55184, Indonesia*

[3] *English Department, Sebelas Maret University, Surakarta 57126, Indonesia*

ABSTRACT

This study examines the translation techniques employed in rendering Javanese proverbs into Indonesian and English and their impact on the quality of the translations. This study used a qualitative design. Four professionals participated in a Focus Group Discussion (FGD) to determine, analyze, and validate the data. They identified the translation techniques and decided their impact on the translation quality. Data were taken from "*Butir-Butir Budaya Jawa*" book which contains Javanese proverbs and their translations in Indonesian and English. We identified 21 of Javanese proverbs. The findings indicate that eleven translation techniques were applied in rendering Javanese proverbs into Indonesian and English. They were established equivalent: 62 (59.04%), explicitation: 14 (13.33%), paraphrase: 13 (12.38%), addition: 5 (4.76%), modulation and pure borrowing: 3 (2.85%), generalization, literal, transposition, and compensation: 1 (0.95%). Established equivalent, explicitation, paraphrase, addition, modulation, transposition, generalization, and compensation have contributed to the accuracy, acceptability, and readability of Javanese proverbs translation. On the other hand, literal translation has resulted in lower accuracy, reduced acceptability, and moderate readability. Pure borrowing has made the translation less acceptable, while reduction has resulted in lower accuracy. The implication of this study for translators is that literal, reduction, and pure borrowing techniques are not recommended due to they have not contributed to the accuracy, acceptability, and readability of translation but they contributed to less accurate, less acceptable and medium readability of translation.

Keywords: Javanese Proverbs; Relay Translation; Translation Technique; Translation Quality; Focus Group Discussion

CORRESPONDING AUTHOR:

Sujatmiko, Linguistics Department, Sebelas Maret University, Surakarta 57126, Indonesia; English Department, PGRI University of Yogyakarta, Yogyakarta 55184, Indonesia; Email: sujatmiko@upy.ac.id

1. Introduction

Javanese proverbs have unique forms, functions, and meanings that contain teaching values for Javanese people in Indonesia[1–3]. Javanese proverbs are to be investigated in terms of the linguistic, literary, and cultural aspects. The issue of translating proverbs has garnered attention from scholars worldwide, who have reported their studies on the translation of proverbs. Studies on translating proverbs have been summarized but little is known about it from the perspective of Javanese proverbs and their translations, translation techniques applied, and their impact on the translation quality. Moreover, this study seems sparse regarding morality messages adopted by Javanese proverbs and their translations. Studies on translating proverbs in literary works[4–7]. Afrouz[4] investigated the Persian proverbs in the classical literary Persian masterpiece, The Gulistan of Sa'di. The study shows that literal translation is the most common way of rendering Persian proverbs. Finally, Afrouz[4] proposed six strategies for translating proverbs mainly in literary texts. Meanwhile, references[5, 6] focused on the proverb's visual representation in comic books and their translation, revealing translators' hard job in rendering idiomatic expressions. In line with[4], Shmelev[7] analyzed the proverbs translation of *Solzhenitsyn's* literary work into English and French in which literal and word-for-word translations were the strategies for rendering the proverbs.

A plethora of scholars have explored the translation of proverbs in novels[8–11]. Bagasheva[8] analyzing the use of proverbs and phraseological units in *Ivan Vazov's* Novel and their rendering in the English and Russian translations. Then, D'Andrea[9] revealed the research on seven Italian translations of the novel around 1877 and 2003, which were translated from French into Italian. The paper also highlighted the analysis of translation strategies used to recreate them in Italian. Meanwhile, Similaru[10] analyzed the proverbs in *Cervantes' exemplary* novels and their Romanian translation. The last investigation, Similaru[11] analyzed the difficulties faced by translators in translating proverbs in novels, focusing on the strategies employed to either use Romanian proverbs or create cultural equivalents when a corresponding proverb did not exist in Romanian.

Other research on proverbs deals with the translation of proverbs into the Arabic language[12–16]. Forty proverbs in the three Arabic full editions of Cervantes' masterpiece

were analyzed[12]. Then, Beji and Zemni[13] investigated Saudi and Tunisian proverbs' cultural meanings and translations focusing on Arabic dialect and culture. They assessed the issue of translation and interpretation of these proverbs. On the other hand, El-Madkouri and Soto Aranda[14] investigated Arabic proverbs translated into Spanish using machine translation tools. Translating proverbs from Arabic into English[15] confirmed that the corresponding proverb in the target language offers the best equivalent for a source language proverb and[16] concentrated on the challenges of conveying the meaning of Arabic proverbs and the study of English proverbs in Arabic by senior students majoring in English.

Exploring the problems of translating English and German proverbs into Russian, Sorokina et al.[17] focused on the correlation between proverbs of different languages based on the comparative analysis of linguistic material of English, German, and Russian. Culture is also a problem in the translation of Jordanian proverbs into English as stated[18]. Ismaili[19] focused on discussing the problematic areas in the translation of proverbs, cultural and religious studies. The findings showcase that culture plays a significant role in translation[19]. Then, Shormani[20] focused on translating translation cultural elements, such as sayings, as the most complicated problem. Translators should replace the cultural element with other cultures.

Ba-Awaidhan[21] stated the multiple cycles of the translation process which involve the source language, target culture, and target language readers. Concentrating on translating Tuvan proverbs, Bredis and Ivanov[22] investigated the importance and expression in translating Tuvan proverbs into Russian and English. Bredis and Ivanov[22] also identified the proverbial factor of vocabulary. A study on proverbs, through the lens of translation, as discussed[23] focused on defining proverbs, their characteristics, and strategies proposed by[24, 25] for rendering proverbs. Meanwhile, Ghazikhani et al.[26] investigated the contrastive analysis of Iranian and Italian proverbs in another study, the focus was on translating proverbs, mainly on dialect embedded in common sayings and proverbs. Ismail[27] explored the solutions to the problems of translating dialects. Other research, translating German and Romanian proverbs and idioms focused on modal particles and modal verbs stated by[28].

Meanwhile, studies on relay translation have also been

widely documented but are limited to the perspective of Javanese proverbs and their translations, translation techniques applied, and their impact on the translation quality. Most studies on relay translation in the field of literature work[29], films[30], biblical stories[31], and novels[32–38]. In addition to literary works, relay translation research is found in private legal documents via English[39], cultural specificity[40], translator training[41], computational approaches[42, 43], audiovisual translation[44, 45], interpreting studies[46, 47], game localization[48], biographies[49], and news production[50, 51].

Initial studies indicate that the study on proverb translation raises questions about the translation techniques used and the quality of the translations. This study focuses on the translation techniques employed in rendering the Javanese proverbs in a relay translation context and the impacts of the translation techniques on the quality of the translations. This study aims to fill the gap. The following questions were formulated:

1. What translation techniques are employed in translating Javanese proverbs in a relay translation context?
2. What is the impact of the translation techniques employed in either Indonesian or English translation on the quality of the translations?

2. Materials and Methods

Data in this study were Javanese proverbs taken from a literary source entitled *"Butir-Butir Budaya Jawa"* book. The second President of the Republic of Indonesia, Mr. Soeharto, compiled it. This book was written for his children as a life guide. In that book, Javanese advice, including proverbs, is displayed in Javanese, Indonesian, and English. Javanese advices are the source text, Indonesian translation is the mediated text, and English translation is the target text. The translation of Javanese advice in Indonesian and in English helps readers understand the Javanese advice since the readers may not understand Javanese; they might prefer to read the Indonesian translation. The translation in English might help English readers, who do not understand either Javanese or Indonesian.

According to[52], a proverb is a sentence or fragment of a sentence that has a frozen form, meaning, and function in society. It is hereditary, used to decorate essays or conversations, reinforces the core intent of an essay, and reflects

advice, teachings, or guidelines for living. Javanese proverbs were selected because Javanese proverbs share stylistic and aesthetic elements, which in essence are different from other forms of literary work. The language and diction remain unique. Javanese proverbs are produced in Javanese social and cultural settings. Both Javanese culture of moral teachings and values are often transmitted communicatively through Javanese proverb expressions[3]. This current study focuses on the relay translation of Javanese proverbs, analyzing accuracy, acceptability, and readability using frameworks[53, 54]. Relay translation in this study refers to Javanese proverbs and their translations in Indonesian and English.

Anchored on the literature review, some scholars have their terminology on the same concept: a translation made by a translated text. They refer to it as relay translation, indirect translation, and mediated translation. Relay translation is denoted as a translation of the translated text (either spoken or written) into a third language[55]. Indirect translation is a translation of a translation[56]. Indirect translation is deemed a process and end product[57]. Mediated translation refers to any translation mediated by another translation[58]. Relay translation involves no less than two translators at the same time, each of whom acts as a relay in the race. Relay translation in this study is translated by human translators: intermediated text translator and target text translator. The abbreviation of ST stands for source text, IT stands for intermediated text, and TT refers to target text translator.

The framework[53] is used to analyze the translation technique applied in rendering Javanese proverbs and their translations. Eighteen translation techniques proposed: (1) adaptation: adapting cultural element of the source language in the target language, (2) amplification which includes addition, explicitation, and paraphrasing: providing more details in target language of any message that are not mentioned in the source text, (3) borrowing—classified into pure borrowing and naturalized borrowing: taking words directly in the source text, (4) calque: literal translation of a foreign word or phrase, (5) compensation: introducing information or stylistic effect of the source text in another place in the target text, (6) description: replacing a term or expression with a description, (7) discursive creation: creating an out of context equivalence, (8) established equivalent: using a term or expression as an equivalent in the target language based on dictionaries, (9) generalization: using a more general term in

the target language, (10) linguistics amplification: adding linguistic elements, (11) linguistics compression: synthesizing linguistic element in the target text, (12) literal translation: using word-for-word translation, (13) modulation: changing the point of view, focus, or cognitive category in relation to the source text, (14) particularization: using a more precise or concrete term, (15) reduction which includes implicitation and omission: suppressing the source text information item in the target text, (16) substitution: changing linguistic elements for paralinguistic element (intonation, gestures) or vice versa, (17) transposition: changing a grammatical category, and (18) variation: changing linguistic or paralinguistic elements (intonation, gestures) that affect aspects of linguistic variation: changes of textual tone, style, social dialect, geographical dialect.

To analyze the impact of translation techniques applied on the translation quality, we employed the [54] framework. A good quality of translation should fill the three indicators, such as accuracy, acceptability, and readability [54]. Accuracy means measuring the equivalence between the source text and the target text message. Meanwhile, acceptability deals with the naturalness of the text for the target text readers. The aspects should be met with the norms and the culture of the target text. Acceptability is used to check whether or not the translation aligns with the norms and culture of the target text, both at the macro and micro levels. It is a key consideration in assessing its quality. The difference of norms and culture between the source text and the target text may result in less acceptability of the target text translation. Readability is used to check whether the readers can understand the text or not. In this case, readability should involve the source and the target text readability. The assessment of translation quality relies on the instruments of accuracy, acceptability, and readability. The translation assessment instrument consists of three parts. The first part is the translation category, the second part is the score ranging from 1 to 3, which shows the translation quality (a higher score reflects better quality), and the last part is the qualitative parameters, which describe the translation according to each score. The following **Tables 1–3** present the assessment instruments of accuracy, acceptability, and readability.

Data were gained by comparing the Javanese proverbs as the source text (ST) with the Indonesian translation as an intermediated text (IT) and the English translation as the target text (TT) to identify the translation techniques applied and their impact on the translation quality. Focus Group Discussion (FGD) is conducting group discussions with a focused theme [59]. FGD is the method authors chose to strengthen research data that has been temporarily obtained from the content analysis method. The purpose of FGD is to determine things that cannot be resolved by authors themselves. FGD forum was chosen as an evaluation and validation in determining the translation techniques applied in both mediated text and target text translation and their impact on the translation quality. Four invited professionals participated actively in the FGD. Language skills in Javanese, Indonesian, and English are shared by all the experts, who are qualified in both the translation and linguistics fields. The following are the qualifications of FGD members: a professor in the translation field (professional translator), an associate professor of translation (professional translator), and a specialist in Javanese, and the others are lecturers on translation and have doctoral degrees in translation fields. To identify the translation techniques and quality, experts and authors conducted FGD. A professor and an associate professor (professional translators) contributed to validating all the translation techniques and quality. Two lecturers on translation and have doctoral degrees in translation, including authors, contributed to determining the translation techniques employed either in mediated text or target text translation and giving scores of translation quality in each of the data.

In the book *"Butir-Butir Budaya Jawa"*, 467 Javanese pieces of advice (non-proverbs) including 21 Javanese proverbs that were examined during the FGD are found. Data were already translated by relay translators into Indonesian and English versions. FGD participants examined the translation techniques applied either in Indonesian or in English. After translation techniques were identified, FGD participants decided on the translation quality of Indonesian and English translations. There were 21 Javanese proverbs found from 467 data items. Some of the data analysis steps are as follows:

1. Comparing Javanese proverbs as a source text with the Indonesian (mediated text) and English (target text) translations.
2. Determining the translation techniques applied either in the mediated text or in the target text.

3. Analysing the impact of translation techniques applied on the translation quality of the mediated text and the target text.

4. Concluding.

Table 1. The accuracy assessment instrument.

Translation Category	Score	Qualitative Parameters
Accurate	3	The meaning of words, technical terms, phrases, clauses, sentences, or the texts of the source language is accurately transferred into the target text—no meaning distortions.
Less accurate	2	Most of the meanings of words, technical terms, phrases, clauses, sentences, or the texts of the source language have been accurately transferred into the target text, but there are still distortions of meaning or translation of double meanings (ambiguous), or there are omitted meanings that offend the message integrity.
Inaccurate	1	The meaning of words, technical terms, phrases, clauses, sentences, or texts of the source language is not accurately transferred into the target text or omitted.

Table 2. The acceptability assessment instrument.

Translation Category	Score	Qualitative Parameters
Acceptable	3	The translations are natural; the technical terms are commonly used and familiar to the readers. Phrases, clauses, or sentences are following the norms or rules of the English language.
Less acceptable	2	In general, the translations are natural, but there are a few problems in the use of technical terms or grammatical errors.
Inacceptable	1	The translations are natural; the technical terms are not commonly used and are not familiar to the readers. Phrases, clauses or sentences do not following the norms or rules of the English language.

Table 3. The readability assessment instrument.

Translation Category	Score	Qualitative Parameters
High readability	3	The words, technical terms, phrases, clauses, sentences, or translation text can be understood easily by the readers.
Medium readability	2	In general, the translation text is understood by the readers, however there are certain parts that must be read more than once by readers to understand.
Low readability	1	The readers cannot understand the translation.

3. Results

3.1. Translation Techniques Applied in Translating Javanese Proverbs in a Relay Translation

Referring to **Table 4**, eleven translation techniques were applied in translating 21 data of Javanese proverbs and their translations in Indonesian and English. The established equivalent is the most dominant technique applied with 62 frequencies (59.04%), the second is explicitation with 14 frequencies (13.33%), then the third is paraphrase with 13 frequencies (12.38%), addition with 5 frequencies (4.76%), pure borrowing and modulation with the same, 3 frequencies (2.85%), and generalization, compensation, literal, reduction, and transposition with only 1 frequency (0.95%). The total of translation technique frequencies is 104. Relay translation consists of the source text (ST), intermediate text (IT), and target text (TT)[60]. The authors used the abbreviations: ST, IT, and TT in this paper. From 21 data on Javanese proverbs, the following are the examples of Javanese proverbs and their translations in Indonesian and English.

Example 1:

ST	*Pangeran iku ora sare.*
IT	*Tuhan itu tidak tidur (Tuhan mengetahui segala-galanya).*
TT	*The Lord does not sleep. (The Lord is aware of everything).*

Referring to Example 1, the set of techniques employed by IT translator in rendering the ST proverb: modulation, addition, and established equivalent. Meanwhile, the following techniques: modulation, established equivalent, and

transposition were employed by TT translator in rendering the IT translation. The word *"Pangeran"* in ST is modulated by the translator into "*Tuhan*" in IT and "*The Lord*" in TT. The words *"iku", "ora"* and *"sare"* in ST were translated into "*itu*", *"tidak"*, *"tidur"* in IT using an established equivalent technique. The word "*tidak tidur*" in IT is translated in TT into *does not sleep* using an established equivalent technique.

Table 4. Translation techniques applied in translating Javanese proverbs.

Translation Technique	Frequency	Percentage
Established equivalent	62	59.04
Explicitation	14	13.33
Paraphrase	13	12.38
Addition	5	4.76
Pure borrowing	3	2.85
Modulation	3	2.85
Generalization	1	0.95
Compensation	1	0.95
Literal	1	0.95
Reduction	1	0.95
Transposition	1	0.95
Total	105	100%

IT translator attempted to clarify the meaning of the ST proverb by adding the information in the IT translation. The sentence *"Tuhan mengetahui segala-galanya"* is additional information to help the readers better understand to grasp the real meaning of the ST proverb. IT translator applied the addition technique in IT translation. The addition technique is used by TT translator in translating *"Tuhan mengetahui segala-galanya"* in IT into *"The Lord is aware of everything"* in TT. The addition technique in TT also helps the readers to easily catch the real meaning of ST proverb.

Javanese proverbs in ST translated into Indonesian proverbs in IT. Authors offer that English proverbs in TT that may have equal meaning in ST and IT are **"God sees everything"** or **"God's mill grinds slow, but sure."**. Therefore, the form of proverbs in ST, IT, and TT can be equaled in meaning.

Example 2:

ST	*Cakra manggilingan.*
IT	*Cakra manggilingan (Hidup itu bagaikan roda yang terus berputar).*
TT	*Life is like a rotating wheel.*

Referring to Example 2, the Javanese proverb in ST was translated into IT using the following techniques: borrowing and addition. IT was translated into TT by using two techniques: established equivalent and reduction. ST proverb *"Cakra manggilingan"* was translated into *"Cakra manggilingan"* in IT using a borrowing technique. IT translator employed the addition technique in IT translation as an effort to make the concept of ST proverb better understood by the readers. The sentence "*Hidup itu bagaikan roda yang berputar"* is the real meaning of ST proverb. Without employing the addition technique in IT, not all readers will understand the real meaning of ST proverb. Meanwhile, TT translator employed a reduction technique. The sentence *"Cakra manggilingan"* in IT was not translated by the translator. The translator only employed the established equivalent by translating *"Hidup itu bagaikan roda yang berputar"* into *"Life is like a rotating wheel"* in TT.

Javanese proverb *"cakra manggilingan"* in ST translated equally into Indonesian proverb "*hidup itu bagaikan roda yang terus berputar"* in IT. "*Life is like a rotating wheel"* in TT is also an equal proverb in English. Other variants of English proverbs for TT translation for Example **(1) call no man happy till he is dead** *(means human destiny can be changed)* and **(2) times is the great/best healer** *(means time determines joy and sorrow, sometimes joy, sometimes sorrow)*. The meaning and the forms of proverbs in ST, IT, and TT based on Example 2 are equal.

Example 3:

ST	*Rame ing gawe sepi ing pamrih, memayu hayuning bawana.*
IT	*Banyak berkarya, tanpa menuntut balas jasa, membangun kebahagiaan dunia.*
TT	*Do work hard without self-interest to enhance the well-being of the world.*

As seen in Example 3, the Javanese proverb in ST "*Rame ing gawe sepi ing pamrih, memayu hayuning bawana*" was translated by IT translator into *"Banyak berkarya, tanpa menuntut balas jasa, membangun kebahagiaan dunia"* employing explicitation technique. Following that, TT was translated using modulation, established equivalent, and transposition. *"Banyak berkarya"* in IT was modulated by the translator into *"Do work hard"* in TT using a modulation technique. Established equivalent techniques can be seen in the following translations: *"tanpa"* was translated into *"without"*, *"membangun"* into *"to enhance"* and *"kebahagiaan dunia"* into *"the well-being of the world"*. On the other hand, the word *"balas jasa"* in IT was translated into *"self-interest"* using the transposition technique.

Authors offer other English translations in TT to make the Javanese proverb in ST have equal meaning in TT. The possible English proverbs translations in TT are *(1) do good without expecting anything in return*, and *(2) act with kindness without seeking rewards*. Since there is no exact English proverb like the same proverb in Javanese, those alternative translations could give more understanding to English readers.

Example 4:

ST	*Ala ketara becik ketitik.*
IT	*Yang buruk dan yang baik akhirnya akan tampak.*
TT	*Evil will eventually be revealed, good will eventually be recognized.*

TT translator applied paraphrase techniques in rendering *"Ala ketara becik ketitik"* in ST into "Evil *will eventually be revealed, good will eventually be recognized"*. Meanwhile, "*Yang buruk dan yang baik akhirnya akan tampak"* in IT was converted using an explicitation technique. IT translator makes the meaning of ST more explicit in IT translation. Javanese proverb in ST can be equaled in meaning in TT by using the English proverb suggested by authors as follows: *(1)* "***what goes around, comes around", (2) "the truth will out", and (3) "good deeds will shine, evil deeds will be exposed".*** Those translation alternatives have the same meaning as the Javanese proverb in ST.

Example 5:

ST	*Ngelmu pari saya isi saya tumungkul.*
IT	*Ilmu padi makin berisi makin merunduk.*
TT	*Be like paddy, which bends deeper as it ripens.*

Example 5 shows established equivalent and paraphrase translation techniques applied by the translator. IT translator applied established equivalent in translating *"ngelmu pari"* into *"ilmu padi"*, *"saya isi"* into *"makin berisi"*, and *"saya tumungkul"* into '*makin merunduk"*. From IT translation, TT translator applied the paraphrase technique into "*Be like paddy, which bends deeper as it ripens"*. The possible English translations proverbs offered by authors in TT translation are *(1) "the more you know, the more you realize you don't know.", (2) "wisdom begins in humility.",* and *(3) "true greatness lies in humility."* Example 5 shows the equal meaning of proverbs in ST, IT, and TT.

Example 6:

ST	*Jun yen lokak (ora kebak) kocak, yen kebak anteng.*
IT	*Jun (sejenis tempayan) yang tidak penuh airnya goncang, kalau penuh tenang.*
TT	*A jug shakes when not fully filled, it is stable when fulled fully.*

Translation techniques encompassed in Example 6 in IT are: pure borrowing, addition, established equivalent, and explicitation. *"Jun"* in ST was purely borrowed by IT translator into the same *"Jun"* in IT and it was translated again into *"a jug"* using a generalization technique. The addition technique can be seen in the sentence *"sejenis tempayan"* in IT. In this case, IT translator attempted to elucidate the concept of *"jun"* in ST in IT by adding the information. The established equivalent was applied in translating: *"kocak"* into *"goncang"*, *"yen kebak anteng"* into *"kalau penuh tenang"*. Meanwhile, *"lokak (ora kebak)"* was translated into *"yang tidak penuh airnya,"* using explicitation technique. As *"ora kebak"* in ST is not explicit; the translator attempted to make it more explicit in IT into *"yang tidak penuh airnya"*.

Meanwhile, in TT translation, translation techniques applied were generalization, compensation, explicitation, and

established equivalent. TT translator generalized *"jun"* into *"a jug"* to be a more general term and to be more acceptable for readers. The word *"shakes"* in IT was altered using compensation as *"shake"* is used to elucidate a ST element of information that cannot be reflected in the same place in TT. Explicitation technique is found in the translation of *"it"*, *"when"*, and *"when filled fully"* in IT. Those translations are more explicit in IT to make the meaning clearer. The word *"yang tidak penuh"* in IT was translated into *"not fully filled"* using an established equivalent. Moreover, *"kalau penuh tenang"* was also translated into *"when filled fully"* using an established equivalent technique.

Javanese proverb in ST is not translated equally with English proverb in TT translator. Therefore, the authors offer translation alternatives in TT as follows: **(1)** "**an empty barrel makes the greatest sound"**, **(2)** "**an empty barrel resounds loudly"**, and **(3)** "**an empty vessel makes the most noises"**. By choosing one of the translation alternatives proposed by the authors, the English readers understand the meaning of the ST proverb. A proverb translated into a proverb means an ideal of translation.

Example 7:

ST	*Mikul dhuwur mendhem jero.*
IT	*Memikul tinggi menanam dalam.*
TT	*Carry high, bury deep. (The body of your deceased parents. Keep their eventual infamous deeds with yourself, talk only of their good deeds).*

Referring to Example 7, a literal technique can be found when IT translator translated literally *"mikul dhuwur mendhem jero"* in ST into *"memikul tinggi menanam dalam"* in IT. Translator translated ST word-for-word in IT. On the other hand, TT translator translated *"memikul tinggi menanam dalam"* in IT using the paraphrase technique into *"carry high, bury deep. (The body of your deceased parents. Keep their eventual infamous deeds with yourself, talk only of their good deeds"*. A paraphrase can be found in the sentence *"the body of your deceased parents, keep their eventual infamous deeds with yourself, talk only of their good deeds,"* which has the real meaning of ST. The translator paraphrased the ST to make the TT translation better understood by the readers.

There is no exact English proverb in TT that is the same in ST. However, the authors offer translation alternatives that represent the equal meaning in ST. They are **(1)** "**honor your father and your mother."**, and **(2)** "**Bury the faults and praise the virtues"**. It is expected that these translation alternatives are better understood by English readers.

Example 8:

ST	*Jer basuki mawa beya*
IT	*Kalau ingin selamat (berhasil), harus ada biayanya (pengorbanan)*
TT	*Success requires cost*

Referring to Example 8, Javanese proverbs in ST translated into *"kalau ingin selamat (berhasil), harus ada biayanya"* in IT used the explicitation technique and it translated again into *"success requires cost"* in TT used the paraphrase technique. The addition technique is applied in IT when the translator adds the words *"berhasil"* and *"pengorbanan"* in IT translation to make better acceptability for readers. According to the authors, the Javanese proverb in ST is successfully translated into English proverb in TT. Other English proverbs may have the equal meaning as in ST and TT proverbs, such as **(1)** "**no pains no gains"**, **(2)** "**no sweat without sweat"**, and **(3)** "**nothing ventured, nothing gained"**. These proverb variants can be alternatives for the translators to apply in the translation.

Example 9:

ST	*Aja dawa tangane*
IT	*Jangan panjang tangan*
TT	*You shall not steal*

As seen in Example 9, IT translator applied an established equivalent technique in translating *"aja"* into *"jangan"*, *"dawa"* into *"panjang"* and *"tangane"* into *"tangan"*. TT translator also applied an established equivalent technique in translating *"jangan"* into '*shall not"* and *"panjang tangan"* into *"steal"*. Meanwhile, an explicitation technique applied in TT. The word *"you"* is explicit in TT translation to translate is more acceptable for readers because if the translation is missing *"you"*, the translation has incomplete structure and it is less acceptable for readers. Other variants of English proverbs may have the equal meaning as in ST and TT proverbs such as **(1)** "**keep your hands to yourself"**, **(2)** "**don't take what isn't yours"**, and **(3)** "**honesty is the best policy"**.

Example 10:

ST	*Aja adigang, adigung, adiguna*
IT	*Jangan memamerkan keluhuran, memamerkan kekuatan, memamerkan kepandaian*
TT	*You shall not be conceited of your high position, power, and capabilities*

Referring to Example 10, IT translator applied established equivalent and paraphrase techniques. The word *"aja"* in ST translated into *"jangan"* in IT used an established equivalent. *"Adigang, adigung, adiguna"* in ST translated into *memamerkan keluhuran, memamerkan kekuatan, memamerkan kepandaian"* used the paraphrase technique. The paraphrase technique is also employed in TT translation. Other variants of English proverbs offered by authors that may have the equal meaning in ST proverb are *(1) "pride comes before a fall"*, and *(2) "don't bite off more than you can chew"*.

Example 11:

ST	*Desa mawa cara negara mawa tata*
IT	*Masing-masing desa dan masing-masing negara itu mempunyai tata cara sendiri-sendiri (lain ladang lain belalang, lain lubuk lain ikannya)*
TT	*Each village has its own ways, and each state its own laws*

The established equivalent is also applied by the translator as seen in Example 11 for example *"desa"* in IT is translated into village in TT, *"negara"* in IT is translated into *"state"* in TT. Meanwhile, the pure borrowing technique applied by the translator in translating *"desa"* and *"negara"* in ST into the same in IT. The addition technique is used when the IT translator adds the words *"masing-masing"*, *"dan"* and *"itu mempunyai"* in IT. Indonesian proverbs *"lain ladang lain belalang, lain lubuk lain ikannya"* also belong to the addition technique applied. The established equivalent is also applied by TT translator when translating *"masing-masing"* into *"each"* in TT, and *"tata cara"* into *"ways"* in TT. The translator also modulated *"tata cara"* into *"laws"* in TT translation. The possible English proverb may have equal meaning with the Javanese proverb in ST is *"different strokes for different folks"*.

Referring to Example 12, established equivalent, explicitation, and addition applied in IT translation. The word *"aja"* translated into *"jangan"* used an established equivalent. *"Ngrusak"* translated into *"merusak"* also translated used established equivalent. Meanwhile, paraphrase is used in TT translation. The possible English proverb may have equal meaning with the Javanese proverb in ST is *"Don't bite the hand that feeds you"*.

Example 12:

ST	*Aja ngrusak pager ayu*
IT	*Jangan merusak kebahagiaan orang lain*
TT	*You shall not seduce the wife or husband of others*

3.2. The Impact of Translation Techniques on the Quality of Translations

Translation techniques applied in IT and TT have contributed to either IT or TT translation quality. Established equivalent has contributed to the accuracy, acceptability, and readability of the translation. Referring to Example 1 in the findings, the words *"iku"*, *"ora"* and *"sare"* in ST were translated into *"itu"*, *"tidak"*, *"tidur"* in IT using the established equivalent techniques. The word *"tidak tidur"* in IT was translated in TT into *"does not sleep"* using an established equivalent technique. The meaning in ST is transferred accurately in IT and TT. The addition technique in which the translator adds more information in IT translation by adding the sentence *"hidup itu bagaikan roda yang berputar"* (Example 2) and *"sejenis tempayan"* (Example 6), which has preserved the meaning inside the ST, is clearer in IT translation. As seen in Examples 11 and 12, IT and TT translations are also made from the addition technique. The impact of the addition technique has contributed to the accuracy, acceptability, and readability of the IT translation.

Pure borrowing technique has led to less acceptability of IT translation. Example 2 shows that the Javanese proverb *"cakra manggilingan"* in ST was translated into *"cakra manggilingan"* in IT. Explicitation technique was used in Example 3 where Javanese proverb in ST *"rame ing gawe sepi ing pamrih, memayu hayuning bawana"* was translated by IT translator into *"Banyak berkarya, tanpa menuntut balas jasa, membangun kebahagiaan dunia"*. The impact of explicitation technique has contributed to the accuracy, acceptability, and readability of the IT translation.

Modulation technique has contributed to the accuracy, acceptability, and readability of translation. As seen in Example 1, the word *"Pangeran"* in ST was translated into

"Tuhan" in IT and *"The Lord"* in TT. In Example 3, *"banyak berkarya"* in IT was also translated into *"do work hard"* in TT through modulation technique. TT translator also applied paraphrase techniques in rendering *"ala ketara becik ketitik"* in ST as seen in Example 4 into *"evil will eventually be revealed, good will eventually be recognized"* in TT. From IT translation in Example 5, TT translator translated *"ilmu padi makin berisi makin menunduk"* in IT into *"be like paddy, which bends deeper as it ripens"* in TT. In Example 7 *"memikul tinggi menanam dalam",* was translated in IT into *"the body of your deceased parents. Keep their eventual infamous deeds with yourself, talk only of their good deeds"* using the paraphrase technique. In Examples 8, 9, and 10, TT translations are made by paraphrase technique. The impact of the paraphrase technique has contributed to the accuracy, acceptability, and readability of the IT translation.

Literal also has an impact on the less accurate, less acceptable, and medium readability of translation as seen in Example 7. The Javanese proverb *"mikul dhuwur mendhem jero"* in ST was literally translated into the *"memikul tinggi menanam dalam"* in IT. It makes the IT translation less accurate and less acceptable in terms of readability because the readers still do not understand the real meaning inside the ST. Readers are still confused to grasp the meaning and have difficulty understanding by reading the IT translation. The addition technique has contributed to the accuracy, acceptability, and readability of translation. It can be seen from Example 1, TT translator translated *"Tuhan mengetahui segala-galanya"* in IT into *"The Lord is aware of everything"* in TT. It helps the readers better grasp the meaning of the proverb.

The reduction technique has contributed to the less accurate translation. It can be seen in Example 2, the sentence *"cakra manggilingan"* in IT was not translated by the translator in TT. It has made the TT translation less accurate. The meaning is not accurately transferred in the target language. Generalization and compensation techniques have contributed to the accuracy, acceptability, and readability of translation. Based on Example 6, TT translator generalized *"jun"* into *"a jug"* in TT to be more general and acceptable for the readers. The word *"shakes"* in IT was rendered to elucidate an ST element of information that cannot be reflected in the same place in TT using the compensation technique. The following are the samples of the translation quality:

3.2.1. Accurate

ST: *Pangeran iku ora sare.*

IT: *Tuhan itu tidak tidur (Tuhan mengetahui segala-galanya).*

TT: *The Lord does not sleep (The Lord is aware of everything).*

IT and TT translations have been translated accurately by employing modulation, established equivalent, and addition techniques. Although there is an addition technique in the sentence *"Tuhan mengetahui segala-galanya"* (IT), it does not matter for the translator to add the information as long as it is appropriate with the ST. The addition technique contributed to the accuracy of IT translation. TT translation is the relay translation of IT translation. The translator also employed the addition technique *"The Lord is aware of everything"* in TT translation as a relay from IT translation. TT translation also represents an accurate translation. The translation quality score based on the[54] parameter is 3 3 3. It means the translation is accurate, acceptable, and highly readable.

3.2.2. Less Accurate

ST: *Mikul dhuwur mendhem jero.*
IT: *Memikul tinggi menanam dalam.*
TT: *Carry high, bury deep. (The body of your deceased parents. Keep their eventual infamous deeds with yourself, talk only of their good deeds).*

The Javanese proverb *"mikul dhuwur mendhem jero"* in ST is literally translated into the *"memikul tinggi menanam dalam"* in IT using literal translation technique. It makes the IT translation less accurate. since the readers still do not understand the real meaning inside the ST. Readers are still confused about the meaning and have difficulty understanding by reading IT translation. The translation quality score based on the[54] parameter is 2 3 3. It means the translation is less accurate, acceptable, and highly readable.

3.2.3. Inaccurate

In this current study, there is no accurate translation data either in IT or TT.

3.2.4. Acceptable

ST: *Jun yen lokak (ora kebak) kocak, yen kebak anteng.*
IT: *Jun (sejenis tempayan) yang tidak penuh airnya goncang, kalau penuh tenang.*

TT: *A jug shakes when not fully filled, it is stable when fulled fully.*

An addition technique involves the translator adding extra information in IT translation. The addition of *sejenis tempayan"* in IT has made the meaning inside the ST clearer in IT translation. The addition technique contributed to the more acceptable translation. The translation quality score based on the [54] parameter is 3 3 3. It means the translation is accurate, acceptable, and highly readable.

3.2.5. Less Acceptable

ST: *Cakra manggilingan.*
IT: *Cakra manggilingan. (Hidup itu bagaikan roda yang terus berputar).*
TT: *Life is like a rotating wheel.*

Javanese proverb *"cakra manggilingan"* in ST was translated into *"cakra manggilingan"* in IT using a pure borrowing technique. As a consequence of it, IT translation is categorized as a less acceptable translation since the readers still do not understand the real meaning of the ST. The readers are still confused to grasp the meaning and have difficulty understanding it by only reading IT translation. The translation quality score based on the [54] parameter is 3 2 3. It means the translation is accurate, less acceptable, and highly readable.

3.2.6. Inacceptable

In this current study, there is no acceptable translation data either in IT or TT.

3.2.7. High Readability

ST: *Ngelmu pari saya isi saya tumungkul.*
IT: *Ilmu padi makin berisi makin merunduk.*
TT: *Be like paddy, which bends deeper as it ripens.*

IT translator applied established equivalent in translating *"ngelmu pari"* into *"ilmu padi"*, *"saya isi"* into *"makin berisi"*, and *"saya tumungkul"* into '*makin merunduk"*. From IT translation, TT translator applied paraphrase technique into *"be like paddy, which bends deeper as it ripens."*. IT and TT translations have high readability of translations. The translation quality score based on the [54] parameter is 3 3 3. It means the translation is accurate, acceptable, and highly readable.

3.2.8. Medium Readability

ST: *Mikul dhuwur mendhem jero.*
IT: *Memikul tinggi menanam dalam.*
TT: *Carry high, bury deep. (The body of your deceased parents. Keep their eventual infamous deeds with yourself, talk only of their good deeds).*

The Javanese proverb *"mikul dhuwur mendhem jero"* in ST was literally translated into *"memikul tinggi menanam dalam"* in IT using literal translation technique. Literal technique contributed to medium readability translation of IT since the readers still do not understand the real meaning inside the ST. Readers are still confused about the meaning and have difficulty understanding by reading IT translation. The translation quality score based on the [54] parameter is 3 3 2. It means the translation is accurate, acceptable, and medium-readable.

3.2.9. Low Readability

There is no low readability translation either in IT or TT.

4. Discussion

Studies on proverb translation and relay translation raise questions about the translation techniques used and the quality of the translations. The result of this study focuses on the translation techniques employed in rendering the Javanese proverbs in a relay translation context and the impacts of the translation techniques on the quality of the translations. Moreover, this study has filled the research gap on translating proverbs since many scholars have reported on translating proverbs but none of their studies focused on translating techniques applied and quality. Some of the translation techniques recommended for translating proverbial expressions according to [53]'s framework are established equivalent, explicitation, addition, modulation, paraphrase, generalization, compensation, and transposition. Those techniques have contributed to the accuracy, acceptability, and readability of translations. Meanwhile, literal, pure borrowing and reduction are not recommended for translators for rendering proverbial expressions. These techniques result in less accurate translations, lower acceptability, and medium readability of translations. Nababan et al. [54]'s framework is also suitable for assessing the quality of translations in this

study since accuracy, acceptability, and readability are the main indicators for a good translation.

The theories elaboration of[53, 54] applied in this study offers innovative insights into the translation field mainly dealing with proverbial expressions translation. These theories can reveal the translation techniques used by a translator in translation and identify their impact on translation quality. The findings of translation techniques such as established equivalent, explicitation, and paraphrasing argued the findings of previous studies that stated literal and word-for-word translation is the common way of rendering proverbs translation.

Based on the findings in this study, some of the Javanese proverbs in ST were not translated into target text proverbs in TT because perhaps the translator of TT is lack of knowledge of English proverbs, even though the translations were accurate and readable in meaning, however, according to authors, the sound of TT translations were not English proverbs. In this case, the authors concluded TT translations were less acceptable translations. Authors offer variants of English translations as seen in the findings in this paper as TT translations revised. It is expected that English readers can feel the sound of English proverbs in TT translations.

The findings of this study are not in line with[7] findings. This previous study reported strategies used in translating proverbs: literal and word-for-word translation. These strategies are not applicable for rendering Javanese proverbs in relay translation in this study because they have contributed to the less accurate, less acceptable, and medium readability of translation. The findings of this study also are not in line with[4] findings, which stated that literal translation is the most common approach for translating proverbs. Literal translation does not work for rendering Javanese proverbs in this study because the literal technique contributed to less acceptable translation. The findings of this paper preserve cultural uniqueness and contribute to moral and social value communication across languages. Though its focus on proverbs limits generalizability, the findings provide valuable guidance for improving culturally embedded translations, balancing theoretical depth and practical relevance in advancing best practices in relay translation.

The implication of these research findings for translators is when they are dealing with proverbial expression translations, they should apply the proper translation techniques proposed by[53] to have accuracy, acceptability, and readability of translation. Translators also should improve the knowledge competence dealing with proverbial expressions of target text translation to fill the equivalent in meaning between source and target text translation. The limitation of this paper is that it did not focus on the translation ideology or the translation method in the relay translation context. It is expected that it will open wider for the next researchers who are interested in analyzing proverb translation in a relay translation context.

5. Conclusions

The framework of[53] is selected in this paper since the authors found that translators in either Indonesian or English employed translation techniques proposed by them. Of the 18 translation techniques, 11 techniques were used by translators. In translating Javanese proverbs in relay translation, the established equivalent was the most employed, the explicitation technique was in the second position employed by both IT and TT translators. Literal, reduction and pure borrowing were not recommended for rendering Javanese proverbs in relay translation because they have contributed to the less accurate translation, less acceptable, and medium readability of translation. Established equivalent, explicitation, addition, modulation, paraphrase, generalization, compensation, and transposition are recommended for rendering Javanese proverbs in relay translation since they have contributed to the accuracy, acceptability, and readability of either IT or TT translations.

Additionally, the translation quality of Javanese proverbs in relay translation in this study is considered less qualified, as the authors found that the translation techniques used, such as pure borrowing, reduction, and literal translation, were not effectively applied. The accuracy of translation is the major effect in determining the quality of a translation compared to acceptability and readability.

Author Contributions

Conceptualization, S. (Sujatmiko) and M.R.N.; methodology, M.R.N.; software, S. (Sujatmiko); validation, M.R.N., D. and S. (Supana); formal analysis, D.; investigation, S. (Sujatmiko); resources, S. (Sujatmiko); data curation, M.R.N.; writing—original draft preparation, S. (Sujatmiko) writ-

Institutional Review Board Statement

Not applicable.

Informed Consent Statement

Not applicable.

Data Availability Statement

The authors confirm that all data generated and analyzed in this study are included in this paper.

Conflicts of Interest

The authors declare no conflict of interest.

References

[1] Karyani, L., Nababan, M.R., Marmanto, S., 2020. Translation analysis on Dayak cultural terms from Dayak Ngaju to Indonesian and English. Langkawi: Journal of The Association for Arabic and English. 6(1), 41–54.

[2] Khrisna, D.A.N., Djatmika, D., 2022. English Live Caption in a Javanese Shadow Puppet Theatre: Systemic Functional Linguistics for Appraising the Beauty of Sagopi. Langkawi: Journal of The Association for Arabic and English. 8(1), 45–58.

[3] Sumarlam, 2020. Javanese proverbs as social control and human character imageries (textual and contextual understanding). In Proceedings of the Third International Seminar on Recent Language, Literature, and Local Culture Studies; Surakarta, Central Java, Indonesia, 20–21 September 2019; pp. 1–9. DOI: https://doi.org/10.4108/eai.20-9-2019.2297044

[4] Afrouz, M., 2022. Translating Proverbs in The Gulistan of Sa'di: Developing a New Taxonomy Based on Baker's (2011) Model. Hikma. 21(1), 53–83. DOI: https://doi.org/10.21071/HIKMA.V21I1.13250

[5] Fernandez, T., 2022. Visual representation of proverbs in comic books and their translation: Asterix as a paradigmatic case. Journal of Graphic Novels and Comics. 13(4), 592–605. DOI: https://doi.org/10.1080/21504857.2021.1966063

[6] Purnomo, S.L.A., Purnama, S.L.S., Untari, L., et al., 2021. Proposing a Typology of Ludification as a Translation Technique for PC, Console, Mobile, and Online Games. Langkawi: Journal of The Association for Arabic and English. 7(1), 25–39.

[7] Shmelev, A., 2020. Translating proverbs in Solzhenitsyn's literary work: Problems and solutions. Shagi/Steps. 6(3), 152–169. DOI: https://doi.org/10.22394/2412-9410-2020-6-3-152-169

[8] Bagasheva, M., 2021. Proverbs and phraseological units in Ivan Vazov's novel "Under the yoke" and their rendering into English and Russian. Ezikov Suyat. 19(3), 52–58. DOI: https://doi.org/10.37708/ezs.swu.bg.v19i3.5

[9] D'Andrea, G., 2022. Proverbs and Pseudo-Proverbs in Notre-Dame de Paris: Analysis of Seven Italian Translations. RILCE. 38(2), 554–576. DOI: https://doi.org/10.15581/008.38.2.554-76

[10] Similaru, L., 2014. The proverbs in Cervantes' exemplary novels and their Romanian translation. Linguistica, 36(1–2), 172–177.

[11] Similaru, L., 2015. Proverbs in "The Works of Persiles and Sigismunda" and its translation into Romanian. Linguistica, 37(1–2), 164–170.

[12] Ahmed, Y., 2014. The three translations into Arabic of Don Quixote by Miguel de Cervantes: Paremiological analysis of the proverbs with correspondence in Arabic. Hermeneus. 35–83.

[13] Beji, J., Zemni, B., 2022. Cultural meanings and translation of Saudi and Tunisian proverbs: Mechanisms and function. Kervan. 26, 37–63. DOI: https://doi.org/10.13135/1825-263X/6539

[14] El-Madkouri, M., Soto Aranda, B., 2022. Readability and Communication in Machine Translation of Arabic Phraseologisms into Spanish. In Proceedings of the 4th International Conference on Computational and Corpus-Based Phraseology, Europhras 2022. Volume 13528, pp. 78–89. DOI: https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-031-15925-1_6

[15] El-Yasin, M., Al-Shehabat, A., 2005. Translating proverbs. Babel. 51(2), 161–173. DOI: https://doi.org/10.1075/babel.51.2.03ely

[16] Khalaf, B., Zin, Z., 2020. Developing a transcultural tool for teaching cultures in translation studies. Inter-

national Journal of Innovation, Creativity, and Change. 11(8), 573–593.

[17] Sorokina, O., Krasnova, I., Shabanova, V., 2020. Problems of translating English and German proverbs into Russian: The comparative aspect. In Proceedings of the 8th Innovative Technologies in Science and Education, ITSE 2020; Trondheim, Norway, 15–19 June 2020. Volume 210, p. 21016. DOI: https://doi.org/10.1051/e3sconf/202021021016

[18] Al-Azzam, B., 2018. Culture as a Problem in the Translation of Jordanian Proverbs into English. International Journal of Applied Linguistics & English Literature. 7(1), 56–63.

[19] Ismaili, J., 2018. Problematic Areas in the Translation of Proverbs. Cultural and Religious Studies. 6(12), 643–659.

[20] Shormani, M., 2020. Does culture translate? Evidence from translating proverbs. Babel. 66(6), 902–927. DOI: https://doi.org/10.1075/babel.00201.sho

[21] Ba-Awaidhan, A., 2020. Cycles of conceptualization and reconceptualization in translating figurative language: With a special focus on selected Arabic-English proverbs. Second Language Learning and Teaching. 47–63. DOI: https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-43336-9_4

[22] Bredis, M., Ivanov, E., 2022. Proverbial factors in translating Tuvan proverbs in the light of normative and poly-lingual paremiography (as contrasted to Russian and English languages). New Research of Tuva. 1, 17–36. DOI: https://doi.org/10.25178/NIT.2022.1.2

[23] Dabaghi, A., Pishbin, E., Niknasab, L., 2010. Proverbs from the Viewpoint of Translation. Journal of Language Teaching and Research. 1(6), 807–814. DOI: https://doi.org/10.4304/jltr.1.6.807-814

[24] Beekman, J., Callow, J., 1974. Translating the Word of God. The Zondervan Corporation for Summer Institute of Linguistics: Dallas, TX, USA.

[25] Mollanazar, H., 2001. Principles and Methodology of Translation. SAMT: Tehran, Iran.

[26] Ghazikhani, B., Akbari, O., Ghanizade, A., 2017. A comparison of women's status in Iranian and Italian cultures: A contrastive analysis of Iranian and Italian proverbs. Research in Contemporary World Literature. 22(2), 525–550. DOI: https://doi.org/10.22059/jor.2017.120932.1179

[27] Ismail, S., 2017. Translating dialect embedded in Najdi proverbs into English. Dialectologia. 19, 93–107.

[28] Ionela, D., 2014. Modal particles and modal verbs in German and Romanian proverbs and idioms. Serla Filologie. 25(1), 126–140.

[29] Pieta, H., Ivaska, L., Gambier, Y., 2023. Structured literature review of published research on indirect translation (2017–2022). Perspectives: Studies in Translation Theory and Practice. DOI: https://doi.org/10.1080/0907676X.2023.2221379

[30] Aleksandrowics, P., 2022. Translating the translated: The applicability of translated literary texts to the subtitling of their film adaptations. perspectives: Studies in translation theory and practice. 30(3), 471–486. DOI: https://doi.org/10.1080/0907676X.2020.1815815

[31] Buts, J., 2022. Invented languages, intertextuality, and indirect translation: Wilde's Salomé in Esperanto. Translation Studies. 15(2), 125–139. DOI: https://doi.org/10.1080/14781700.2021.2016481

[32] Allwood, A., 2021. (Semi) Peripheries in contact: Indirect translation of novels into Swedish 2000–2015. Stridon. Journal of Studies in Translation and Interpreting. 1(1), 57–77. DOI: https://doi.org/10.4312/stridon.1.1.57-77

[33] Brodie, G., 2018. Indirect translation on the London stage: Terminology and (In)visibility. Translation Studies. 11(3), 333–348. DOI: https://doi.org/10.1080/14781700.2018.1447990

[34] Hadley, J., 2017. Indirect translation and discursive identity: Proposing the concatenation effect hypothesis. Translation Studies. 183–197. DOI: https://doi.org/10.1080/14781700.2016.1273794

[35] Haroon, H., 2022. Indirect translation and the influence of the mediating text: The case of Le Petit Prince in Malay. Language, Linguistics, and Literature Journal. 28(1), 167–180. DOI: https://doi.org/10.17576/3L-2022-2801-12

[36] Hongisto, T., Taivalkoski, S.K., 2023. Sameness of plot in indirect translation: What events remain in complex translation chains? Perspectives: Studies in Translation Theory and Practice. 31(5), 787–802. DOI: https://doi.org/10.1080/0907676X.2022.2097878

[37] Hosseini, A., 2021. The Differences between direct and indirect translation: An assessment of two translations of the Japanese novel black rain. Language Related Research. 11(6), 229–255. DOI: http://lrr.modares.ac.ir/article-14-38391-en.html

[38] Zainol, I.S., Haroon, H., 2019. From French into Malay via English: the indirect translation of Henri Fauconnier's Malaisie into Malay. Kemanusiaan. 26(2), 105–122. DOI: https://doi.org/10.21315/kajh2019.26.2.5

[39] Dordevic, J., 2022. Indirect Translations of terminology in private legal documents via English: The case of Serbian to Albanian translation. Revista de Llengua. 7, 111–125. DOI: https://doi.org/10.2436/rld.i77.2022.3640

[40] Buts, J., Hadley, J., Aboomar, M., 2022. Keyness, context, and cultural specificity in indirect translation. TransLogos, a Translation Studies Journal. 5(1), 1–21. DOI: https://doi.org/10.29228/transLogos.40

[41] Torres-Simon, E., Pieta, H., Bueno Maia, R., et al., 2021. Indirect translation in translator training: taking stock and looking ahead. Interpreter and Translator Trainer. 15(2), 260–281. DOI: https://doi.org/10.1080/

1750399X.2020.1868173

[42] Ivaska, I., Ivaska, L., 2022. Source language classification of indirect translations. Target. 34(3), 370–394. DOI: https://doi.org/10.1075/target.00006.iva

[43] Ustaszewski, M., 2021. Towards a machine learning approach to the analysis of indirect translation. Translation Studies. 34(3), 323–338. DOI: https://doi.org/10.1080/14781700.2021.1894226

[44] Casas-Tost, H., Bustins, S., 2021. The role of pivot translations in Asian film festivals in Catalonia. Johnny Ma's Old Stone as a case study. Journal of Audiovisual Translation. 4(1), 96–113. DOI: https://doi.org/10.47476/jat.v4i1.2021.85

[45] Jin, H., Zhang, Y., He, X., 2022. Indirect translation of foreign films for cinematic release in China. Target. 34(3), 465–488. DOI: https://doi.org/10.1075/target.00010.jin

[46] Bravo, E.A.F., 2022. Indirect interpreting: Stumbling block or stepping stone? Spanish booth perceptions of relay. Target. 34(3), 512–536. DOI: https://doi.org/10.1075/target.00008.bra

[47] Pochhaker, F., 2022. Relay interpreting: Complexities of real-time indirect translation. Target. 34(3), 489–511. DOI: https://doi.org/10.1075/target.00009.poc

[48] O'Hagan, M., 2022. Indirect translation in game localization as a method of global circulation of digital artefacts: A socio-economic perspective. Target. 34(3), 441–464. DOI: https://doi.org/10.1075/target.00007.oha

[49] Son, S., 2021. The translating subject beyond borders: Relay translations of biographies of George Washington in East Asia in the early twentieth century. Sungkyung Journal of East Asian Studies. 21(1), 83–103. DOI: https://doi.org/10.1215/15982661-8873945

[50] Davier, L., 2022. Translational phenomena in the news: Indirect translation as the rule. Target. 34(3), 395–418. DOI: https://doi.org/10.1075/target.20160.dav

[51] Valdeon, R.A., 2022. On the role of indirect translation in the history of news production. Target. 34(3), 419–440. DOI: https://doi.org/10.1075/target.00011.val

[52] Kridalaksana, H., 1983. Kamus Linguistik. PT. Gramedia: Jakarta, Indonesia.

[53] Molina, L., Albir, A., 2002. Translation techniques revisited: A dynamic and functionalist approach. Meta. 47(4), 498–512. DOI: https://doi.org/10.7202/008033ar

[54] Nababan, M., Ardiani, N., Sumardiono, 2012. Pengembangan model penilaian kualitas terjemahan. Jurnal Kajian Linguistik dan Sastra. 24(1), 39–57.

[55] Andre, S.J., 2020. Relay Translation. In: Baker, M., Saldanha, G. (eds.). Routledge Encyclopedia of Translation Studies, 3rd ed. Routledge: London, UK. pp. 471–473.

[56] Pieta, H., 2017. Theoretical, methodological, and terminological issues in researching indirect translation: A critical annotated bibliography. Translation Studies. 10(2), 198–216. DOI: https://doi.org/10.1080/14781700.2017.1285248

[57] Jia, H., 2020. Indirect translation: A semiotic perspective. Chinese Semiotic Studies. 16(3), 373–397. DOI: https://doi.org/10.1515/css-2020-0021

[58] Rosa, A., Pieta, H., Bueno Maia, R., 2017. Theoretical, methodological, and terminological issues regarding indirect translation: An overview. Translation Studies. 10(2), 113–132. DOI: https://doi.org/10.1080/14781700.2017.1285247

[59] Santosa, R., 2017. Metode penelitian kualitatif kebahasaan. UNS Press: Surakarta.

[60] Ringmar, M., 2012. Relay Translation. In: Gambier, Y., Doorslaer, L. (eds.). Handbook of Translation Studies. John Benjamins Publishing Company: Amsterdam, The Netherlands. pp. 141–144.